

TEACHING AMERICAN HISTORY PROJECT
Lesson Title –Incident at Homestead; Frick Vs. the Union
From David Chassanoff

Grade – 8

Length of class period – 53 minutes

Inquiry – Students will be looking at two viewpoints of the same event and decide which is more credible.

Objectives- Students will be able to recognize bias in both writings. They will also be corroborating the two competing stories and come up with questions for future research. Skills that are stressed with the guiding questions are: understanding source, identifying bias / tone, cloze reading, corroboration.

Materials - Source #1 – Writings of Emma Goldman. Source #2 Interview by Henry Clay Frick. Timeline. Lecture Notes. Guiding questions for use w/ primary sources.

Activities - The teacher will give background information using the lecture notes. Students will see the sequence of events using the timeline. Source #1 will be read in class (either by the teacher or by students out loud). Next, students will work through the guiding primary source questions individually as they analyze Source #2. As a wrap up, the teacher will facilitate a conversation by seeing who found Source #1 as more ‘believable’ and who found Source #2 more ‘believable’. Then we discuss the bias and problems in both accounts. The sources are very important for students to note.

How will you assess what student learned during this lesson?

I am collecting the guiding questions and counting it as a classroom assignment in my gradebook. As I expand this unit, I will probably be adding a question about the Amalgamated Association on a test.

Connecticut Framework Performance Standards –
Standard 2

Students will be able to: 2.2 – Interpret information from a variety of primary and secondary sources, including electronic media (e.g., maps, charts, graphs, images, artifacts, recordings and text).

Grade 8 – 2. Compare information about the same event using a variety of primary sources.

Source #1 Emma Goldman (edited)

It was May 1892. Trouble had broken out between the Carnegie Steel Company and its workers, organized in the Amalgamated Association of Iron and Steel Workers. Amalgamated Association was one of the biggest and most efficient unions in the country, consisting mostly of strong Americans, men of decision and grit, who stood up for their rights. The Carnegie Company, on the other hand, was a powerful corporation. Andrew Carnegie, its president, had turned over management to Henry Clay Frick, a man known for his hatred of unions and workers.

The Carnegie Company enjoyed great wealth and prosperity. Wages were arranged between the company and the union, according to a sliding scale based on the current market price of steel products.

Andrew Carnegie decided to abolish the sliding scale. The company would make no more agreements with the Amalgamated Association. In fact, he would not recognize the union at all. Then, he closed the mills. It was an open declaration of war.

The steel-workers declared that they were ready to take up the challenge of Frick: they would insist on their right to organize and to deal collectively with their employers. Their tone was manly, ringing with the spirit of their rebellious forebears of the Revolutionary War.

Then the news flashed across the country of the slaughter of steelworkers by Pinkertons. In the dead of night, Frick sent a boat packed with strike-breakers and heavily armed Pinkerton thugs to the mill. The workers stationed themselves along the shore, determined to drive back Frick's hirelings. When the boat got within range, the Pinkertons had opened fire, without warning, killing a number of Homestead men on the shore, among them a little boy, and wounding scores of others.

Source: Emma Goldman was a political activist and radical who strongly supported workers' rights. This information comes from her autobiography, written in 1931, where she recounts the Homestead crisis that happened 39 years earlier.

Source #2 Henry Clay Frick (edited)

I can say as clearly as possible that under no circumstances will we have any further dealings with the Amalgamated Association as an organization. This is final.

The workmen in the Amalgamated Association work under what is known as a sliding scale. As the price of steel rises, the earnings of the men also rise; as the prices fall, their wages also fall. The wages are not allowed to fall below a certain amount, which is called the minimum. Until now, the minimum has been \$25 per ton of steel produced. We have recently changed the minimum to \$23 instead of \$25. We believe this is reasonable because the Carnegie Company has spent a lot of money on new machinery that allows workers to increase their daily output, and therefore increase their earnings. The Amalgamated Association was unwilling to consider a minimum below \$24, even though the improved machinery would enable workers to earn more. We found it impossible to arrive at any agreement with the Amalgamated Association, so we decided to close our works at Homestead.

The Amalgamated men surrounded our property and blocked all of the entrances and all roads leading to Homestead. We felt that for the safety of our property, it was necessary for us to hire our own guards to assist the sheriff.

We brought our guards here as quietly as possible; had them taken to Homestead at an hour of the night when we hoped to have them enter without any interference whatever and without meeting anybody. All our efforts were to prevent the possibilities of a confrontation between the Amalgamated Association and our guards.

We have investigated and learned that the Amalgamated men and their friends fired on our guards for twenty-five minutes before they reached our property, and then again after they had reached our property. Our guards did not return the fire until after the boats had touched the shore, and after three of our guards had been wounded, one fatally.

Source: In this newspaper interview in the Pittsburgh Post on July 8, 1892, Frick explains his argument against the Union.

Homestead Strike Timeline

Where: Homestead, Pennsylvania

Union: Amalgamated Association of Iron and Steel Workers

Company: Carnegie Steel Company

1876:

Amalgamated Association, union for iron and steel workers created.

1881:

Carnegie puts Frick in charge of the Homestead factory.

1882 and 1889:

Amalgamated Association won two big strikes against the Carnegie Company. After 1889, the union became very powerful and organized. They had a very strong union contract.

February 1892:

Amalgamated Association asked for a wage increase. Frick responds with a wage decrease.

June 29, 1892:

The old contract expired without the two sides reaching an agreement. Frick locked the workers out of the plant, using a high fence topped with barbed wire.

June 30, 1892:

Workers decided to strike and they surrounded the plant to make sure that no scab workers would enter.

July 6, 1892:

After the local sheriff was unable to control the strikers, Frick hired guards from the National Pinkerton Detective Agency to secure the factory so that strikebreakers could enter.

The Pinkertons arrived by boat in the middle of the night, hoping to surround the factory unnoticed.

The strikers knew they were coming. Shots were fired and people killed on both sides.

**Dates & events used from Wikipedia: Homestead Strike; Amalgamated Association.*

Entire document found at: <http://historymatters.gmu.edu/d/99/>

Lecture Notes:

- Andrew Carnegie (robber baron, dominates the steel industry) owned a steel mill in Homestead, PA, near Pittsburgh.
- Union at the steel mill, the Amalgamated Association, formed and won a couple of early strikes.
- Homestead was run by Henry Clay Frick whose goal was to break the union.
- When the union's contract was up in 1892, Frick refused to negotiate a new contract and locked workers out.
- Frick hired the Pinkerton Detectives to provide security and break the strike.
- When the Pinkertons tried to enter the mill, there was conflict. The conflict lasted for 14 hours and left 16 people dead.
- The strike lasted four more months until the union gave in. Frick succeeded in breaking the union.

The Homestead Strike: was violence necessary

Name:

Class:

1. Who wrote each piece? What is his/her perspective?
2. How might Frick's description & his language differ from Goldman's?
3. (Consider the date: July 8 – two days after the actual violence). How could this have played a role in what Frick would say?
4. In each piece, what words or phrases stand out?
5. Is there any evidence, Frick is trying to sound reasonable or logical? What is his motive?
6. Why did the Homestead Strike turn violent?
7. What are the differences between the two accounts?

Entire document found at: <http://historymatters.gmu.edu/d/99/>

The Homestead Strike: was violence necessary

Name:

Class:

8. Which account do you find more believable?

9. Can we ever know what happened?

10. What other materials would you want to look at in order to try to figure out what happened at Homestead?