

TEACHING AMERICAN HISTORY PROJECT

Slave v. Wage Labor *From Kristen DeBona*

Grade – 11th Grade U.S. History

Length of class period – (2) 50 minutes [Note: While the activity takes two periods to do, I set aside extra time to discuss what the students learned and analyzed.]

Inquiry – (What essential question are students answering?)

- *What type of economic systems emerged as a result of the post-War of 1812 Industrialization of the US?*
- *How did regional economies in the north and south create two different labor systems?*
- *Which economic system was worse for laborers – slave labor or wage labor?*

Objectives (What content and skills do you expect students to learn from this lesson?)

- *The students will analyze various written primary sources in order to examine and compare southern plantation slave labor versus northern factory wage labor.*

Materials (What primary sources or local resources are the basis for this lesson?)

- Slave v. Wage Labor Analysis Documents
- Slave v. Wage Labor Analysis Worksheet
- Make the Case Persuasive Writing Outline
- Wage Labor v. Slave Labor Writing Outline Rubric

Activities (What will you and your students do during the lesson to promote learning?)

- **Initiation:** Review how the War of 1812 and Embargo Act caused the US to industrialize and how this industrialization and mechanization created regional economies and labor systems to develop.
- Assign the students to work in small groups no bigger than 3-4. (smaller groups work best)
- Instruct the students that they will need to get through the Slave Labor Documents on day 1 and Wage Labor Documents on day 2.
- Students should work together to read and comprehend the available slave narratives, plantation rules, wage labor petitions, and personal letter by answering the analysis questions on the Document Analysis Worksheet and using textual support.
- Monitor the students as they progress from document to document, point out interesting aspects within individual excerpts and sources, and ask questions to help the students analyze each set of sources.
- **Closure:** Verbally close the lesson by explaining the Persuasive Writing Outline and asking and discussing the following essential question:
 - *Which economic system was worse for laborers – slave labor or wage labor?*

How will you assess what student learned during this lesson?

- **Informal:** Monitor and assess the students' analysis by asking them questions during the activity.
- **Formal:** Collect and grade the student's analysis worksheets and persuasive writing outline as well as hold them accountable for the material on the unit test/quiz.

Connecticut Framework Performance Standards

- Explain the changing nature of the U.S. economy.
- Assess the influence of geography on the development of the U.S.
- Analyze the influence of sectionalism on American life.
- Evaluate primary and secondary interpretations of a historical event
- Ask relevant questions related to social studies/history to initiate, extend, debate a point of view

SLAVE LABOR DOCUMENT A: Slave Narratives

Charity Anderson

My old Marster was a good man, he treated all his slaves kind, and took care of dem. It sho' was hard for us older uns to keep de little cullered chillun out ob de dinin' room whar ol marster ate, cause when dey would slip in and stan' by his cheer, when he finished eatin' he would fix a plate and gib dem and dey would set on de hearth and eat.

But honey chile, all white folks warn 't good to dere slaves, cause I'se seen pore niggers almos' tore up by dogs, and whipped unmercifully, when dey did'nt do lack de white folks say . But thank God I had good white folks, dey sho' did trus' me to, I had charge of all de keys in the house and I waited on de Missy and de chillun. I laid out all dey clos' on Sat 'dy night on de cheers, and den Sund'y mawnings I'd pick up all de dirty clos', they did'nt have to do a thing.

Richard Toler

Ah never had no good times till ah was free. Ah was bo'n on Mastah Tolah's (Henry Toler) plantation down in ole V'ginia,. Mah pappy was a slave befo' me, and mah mammy, too. His name was George Washington Tolah, and her'n was Lucy Tolah. We took ouah name from ouah ownah, and we lived in a cabin way back of the big house, me and mah pappy and mammy and two brothahs.

They nevah mistreated me, neithah. They's a whipping the slaves all the time, but ah run away all the time. And I jus' tell them - if they whipped me, ah'd kill 'em, and ah nevah did get a whippin'. If ah thought one was comin' to me, Ah'd hide in the woods; then they'd send aftah me and they say, 'Come, on back, - we won't whip you'. But they killed some of the niggahs, whipped 'em to death. Ah guess they killed three or fo' on Tolah's place while ah was there.

Ah never went to school. Learned to read and write my name after ah was free in night school, but they nevah allowed us to have a book in ouah hand, and we couldn't have no money neither. If we had money we had to tu'n it ovah to ouah ownah. Chu'ch was not allowed in neithah.



SLAVE LABOR DOCUMENT B: Excerpts from Plantation Management, De Bow

The following rules for the instruction of overseers, and the *Management of Negroes*, are by Mr. St. Geo Cocke, one of the wealthiest and most intelligent planters of the old dominion. They are worthy of the note of planters everywhere:

PLANTATION MANAGEMENT. POLICE.

- It is strictly required of the manager that he rise at the dawn of day every morning; that he blow a horn for the assembling of the hands; require all hands to repair to a certain and fixed place in ten minutes after the blowing of the horn; after which the hands will receive their orders and be started to their work under charge of the foreman.
- As soon as the horse and stock have been fed and otherwise attended to, the manager will take his breakfast; and then repair to the fields to look after the hands; and he will remain with them as constantly as possible during every day.
- There will be stated hours for the negroes to breakfast and dine, and those hours must be regularly observed. Breakfast will be at eight o'clock, and dinner at one o'clock.
- The manager will, every Sunday morning after breakfast, visit and inspect every quarter, see that the houses and yards are kept clean and in order, and that the families are dressed in clean clothes.
- The clothing to be furnished each year will be as follows: --
 - To each man and boy, 1 woolen coat, 1 pair pants, 1 pair of socks, 1 shirt, 1 pair of shoes, 1 wool hat, and a blanket every second year, to be given 15th of November. 1 shirt, 1 pair of cotton pants, 1 straw hat, 1 pair of shoes, to be given 1st of June.
 - To each woman and girl, 1 woolen frock, and to those who work in the field 1 woolen cape, 1 cotton shift, 1 pair stockings, 1 pair shoes, 1 cotton head handkerchief, 1 summer suit of frock and shift, a blanket every second year, and to women with more than one child, 2 blankets every second year.
 - To children under 10 years of age, 1 winter and summer suit each.
- Provisions will be issued weekly as follows:
 - *Field Hands*. To each man, three and a half pounds bacon, and one and a half pecks meal. To each woman, girl and boy, two and a half pounds bacon, and one peck meal.
 - *InDoor Hands*. To each man and boy, two pounds bacon, and one peck corn meal. To each woman and girl, two pounds bacon, and one peck corn meal. To each child over two years and under ten years, one pound bacon, and half a peck of corn meal.
 - To the above will be added milk, buttermilk, and molasses, at intervals, and at all times vegetables, and fresh meat occasionally.
- A horn will be sounded every night at nine o'clock, after every negro will be required to be at his quarters, and to retire to rest, and that this rule may be strictly enforced, the manager will frequently, but at irregular and unexpected hours of the night, visit the quarters and see that all are present, or punish absentees.
- Each manager will do well to organize in his neighborhood, whenever practicable, patrol parties, in order to detect and punish irregularities of the negroes, which are generally committed at night.

SLAVE LABOR DOCUMENT C: Excerpts from Alexander Telfair, "Plantation Rules," from Ulrich Phillips, ed., *Plantation and Frontier*, Volume 1

Rules and directions for my Thorn Island Plantation by which my overseers are to govern themselves in the management of it. (The directions in this book are to be strictly attended to.)

- The allowance for every grown Negro however old and good for nothing, and every young one that works in the field, is a peck of corn each week, and a pint of salt, and a piece of meat, not exceeding fourteen pounds, per month.
- No Negro to have more than Fifty lashes inflicted for any offence, no matter how great the crime.
- You will give tickets to any of the negroes who apply for them, to go anywhere about the neighborhood, but do not allow them to go off it without, nor suffer any strange negroes to come on it without a pass.
- All visiting between this place and the one in Georgia is forbidden, except with Tickets from the respective overseers, and that but very seldom. There are none who have husbands or wives over there, and no connections of the kind are to be allowed to be formed.
- No night meeting and preaching to be allowed on the place, except on Saturday night & Sunday morn.
- If there is any fighting on the Plantation, whip all engaged in it for no matter what the cause may have been, all are in the wrong.
- My Cotton is packed in Four & a half yard Bags, weighing each 300 pounds.
- My Negroes are not allowed to plant Cotton for themselves. Everything else they may plant, and you will give them tickets to sell what they make.
- I have no Driver. You are to task the negroes yourself, and each negro is responsible to you for his own work, and nobodies else.
- I leave my Plantation Shot Gun with you.

WAGE LABOR DOCUMENT A: The Condition of the Operatives

MR. CASE: - DEAR SIR:

Since I was between seven and eight years old, I have been employed almost without intermission in a factory, which is almost 18 years. During this time I have not attended school more than one year. You must acknowledge I ought to be a judge of factory life. I should like to give you my whole experience, but this would take too much room. And I beside, you would hardly believe what I should state, although it would be true, so I will confine myself to Lowell, the place where operatives are used as well, I think as any place in New England.

I do not wonder at your surprise that the operatives were worked in the summer season, from five in the morning till seven in the evening. Especially when you had been previously informed that we worked but ten hours per day. But 'tis true, we do all this, and against our wishes too. I know scarcely an operative, who would not have it otherwise if they could. But they do not wish their wages cut down, for they have barely enough to live on now.

The time we are required to labor is altogether too long. If anyone doubts it, let them come into our mills of a summer's day, at four or five o'clock, in the afternoon, and see the drooping, weary persons moving about, as though their legs were hardly able to support their bodies. If this does not convince them, let them try their hand at it a while, and they will find the thing demonstrated at once. I have been an overseer myself, and many times have I had girls faint in the morning, in consequence of the air being so impure in the mill.

We commence as soon-and work as long as we can see almost the year round, and for nearly half the year we work by lamp light, at both ends of the day lighting up both morning and evening. And besides this, from November till March our time is from twenty minutes to half an hour too slow. So you see instead of getting out of the factory at half past seven o'clock in the evening, it is *really* eight. And more than this some of the clocks are so fixed as to lose ten minutes during the day and gain ten minutes during the night, thereby getting us into the mill five minutes before five in the morning and working us five minutes after seven at night.

Yours for the right,

R.

WAGE LABOR DOCUMENT B: Excerpts from Investigation of Labor Conditions

Massachusetts House Document, no. 50

The petitions which were referred to your committee, came from the city of Lowell, and was signed by 850, "peaceable, industrious, hard working men and women of Lowell." The petitioners declare that they are confined "from thirteen to fourteen hours per day in unhealthy apartments," and are thereby "hastening through pain, disease and privation, down to a premature grave." They therefore ask the Legislature "to pass a law providing that ten hours shall constitute a day's work..."

Petition From **Mr. [John] Clark**, we obtained the following table of the time which the mills run during the year.

Begin work

From May 1st to August 31st, 5 o'clock

From September 1st to April 30th, as soon as they can see

Breakfast.

From November 1st to February 28th, before going to work

From March 1st to March 31st, 7:15

From April 1st to September 19th. 7 o'clock

From September 20th to October 31st, 7:30 o'clock

Dinner

Through the year, 12:30 o'clock

From May 1st to August 31st, 45 minutes

From September 1st to April 30th, 30 minutes

Quit work

From May 1st to August 31st, 7 o'clock

From September 1st to September 19th, at dark

From September 20th to March 19th, 7:30

From March 20th to April 30th, at dark

Lamps are never lighted on Saturday evenings.

There are four days in the year which are observed as holidays, and on which the mills are never put in motion. These are Fast Day, Fourth of July, Thanksgiving Day, and Christmas Day. The following table shows the average hours of work per day, throughout the year, in the Lowell Mills:

Month	Hours	Min.	Month	Hours	Min.
January	11	24	July	12	45
February	12		August	12	45
March [11]	11	52	September	12	23
April	13	31	October	12	10
May	12	45	November	11	56
June	12	45	December	11	24

Eliza R. Hemmingway. She had worked 2 years and 9 months in the Lowell Factories. Her employment is weaving-works by the piece. She complained of the hours for labor being too many, and the time for meals too limited. In the summer season, the work is commenced at 5 o'clock, a.m., and continued till 7 o'clock, p.m., with half an hour for breakfast and three quarters of an hour for dinner. During eight months of the year, but half an hour is allowed for dinner.

The air in the room she considered not to be wholesome. About 130 females, 11 men, and 12 children (between the ages of 11 and 14) work in the room with her. Thinks that there is no day when there are less than six of the females out of the mill from sickness. Has known as many as thirty. She, herself, is out quite often, on account of sickness.

She thought there was a general desire among the females to work but ten hours, regardless of pay. She knew of many cases where married women came to Lowell and worked in the mills to assist their husbands to pay for their farms. The moral character of the operatives is good. There was only one American female in the room with her who could not write her name.

Miss Judith Payne testified that she came to Lowell 16 years ago, and worked a year and a half in the Merrimack Cotton Mills, left there on account of ill health, and remained out over seven years. She was sick most of the time she was out. She has lost, during the last seven years, about one year from ill health. She is a weaver, and attends three looms. She attributes her ill health to the long hours of labor, the shortness of time for meals, and the bad air of the mills.

Miss Olive J. Clark There is hardly a week in which there is not someone out on account of sickness. Thinks the air is bad, on account of the small particles of cotton which fly about.

SLAVE LABOR DOCUMENT A: Questions

1. Using the slave narratives of Charity Anderson and Richard Toler, draw three conclusions about what life was like for a slave. At least 1 conclusion must be drawn from each narrative. Back up each conclusion with a piece of quoted evidence.

<i>Conclusion #1</i>	
<i>Evidence #1</i>	
<i>Conclusion #2</i>	
<i>Evidence #2</i>	
<i>Conclusion #3</i>	
<i>Evidence #3</i>	

SLAVE LABOR DOCUMENT B: Questions

1. Using the excerpt from Plantation Management, draw three conclusions about how a plantation system was organized and run. Back up each conclusion with a piece of quoted evidence.

<i>Conclusion #1</i>	
<i>Evidence #1</i>	
<i>Conclusion #2</i>	
<i>Evidence #2</i>	
<i>Conclusion #3</i>	
<i>Evidence #3</i>	

SLAVE LABOR DOCUMENT C: Questions

1. Using the excerpt from Plantation Management, draw three conclusions about how a slave labor force was controlled and ruled by overseers. Back up each conclusion with a piece of quoted evidence.

<i>Conclusion #1</i>	
<i>Evidence #1</i>	
<i>Conclusion #2</i>	

<i>Evidence #2</i>	
<i>Conclusion #3</i>	
<i>Evidence #3</i>	

WAGE LABOR DOCUMENT A: Questions

- Using the excerpt from The Conditions of the Operatives, identify three complaints that the worker makes in his/her letter to Mr. Case. Back up each complaint with a piece of quoted evidence.

<i>Complaint #1</i>	
<i>Evidence #1</i>	
<i>Complaint #2</i>	
<i>Evidence #2</i>	
<i>Complaint#3</i>	
<i>Evidence #3</i>	

WAGE LABOR DOCUMENT B: Questions

- Using the excerpt from The Conditions of the Operatives, draw three conclusions about what factory life was like for wage laborers. Back up each conclusion with a piece of quoted evidence.

<i>Conclusion #1</i>	
<i>Evidence #1</i>	
<i>Conclusion #2</i>	
<i>Evidence #2</i>	
<i>Conclusion #3</i>	
<i>Evidence #3</i>	

Make the Case: Persuasive Writing Outline

Assignment: Your job is to complete the attached persuasive writing outline. All answers must be grammatically correct and in complete sentences using *neat* handwriting.

The Prompt: Make the case by answering the following question: Which economic system was worse for laborers, wage labor or slave labor?

Persuasive Writing Outline

INTRODUCTION PARAGRAPH:

Background Information: What 3 facts would the reader have to know in order to understand the topic I am writing about?

<i>Fact #1</i>	
<i>Fact #2</i>	
<i>Fact #3</i>	

The Opposing Opinion: What would someone who disagrees with me think about this topic?

The Opposing Opinion: What reason would the opposition use to support their argument? _____

Thesis: What is my position about the topic? _____

Reasons: What 3 Reasons support my position?

<i>Reason #1</i>	
<i>Reason #2</i>	
<i>Reason #3</i>	

BODY PARAGRAPH 1 STRUCTURE: ARGUING YOUR 1st REASON

Topic Sentence: Describes the first reason you are supporting the position. _____

Supportive Evidence: You must make the case for your reason – so think like an attorney. What is your specific proof to show that your reason is valid? Why should someone believe you? [Hint: Name names, provide statistics, use paraphrased/short phrase quotes from experts, provide specific details that someone could verify].

Proof #1	Source
Proof #2	Source

Connection: Explain why your reason shows that your opinion is valid. Why is your reason an important one? How does your reason point to a bigger concept/issue/problem? Use persuasion to get the reader to agree with you. _____

BODY PARAGRAPH 2 STRUCTURE: ARGUING YOUR 2nd REASON

Topic Sentence: Describes the second reason you are supporting the position. _____

Supportive Evidence: You must make the case for your reason – so think like an attorney. What is your specific proof to show that your reason is valid? Why should someone believe you? [Hint: Name names, provide statistics, use paraphrased/short phrase quotes from experts, provide specific details that someone could verify].

Proof #1	Source
Proof #2	Source

Connection: Explain why your reason shows that your opinion is valid. Why is your reason an important one? How does your reason point to a bigger concept/issue/problem? Use persuasion to get the reader to agree with you. _____

BODY PARAGRAPH 3 STRUCTURE: ARGUING YOUR 3rd REASON

Topic Sentence: Describes the third reason you are supporting the position. _____

Supportive Evidence: You must make the case for your reason – so think like an attorney. What is your specific proof to show that your reason is valid? Why should someone believe you? [Hint: Name names, provide statistics, use paraphrased/short phrase quotes from experts, provide specific details that someone could verify].

Proof #1	Source
Proof #2	Source

Connection: Explain why your reason shows that your opinion is valid. Why is your reason an important one? How does your reason point to a bigger concept/issue/problem? Use persuasion to get the reader to agree with you. _____

CONCLUSION PARAGRAPH STRUCTURE:

Topic Sentence: Bring the argument back to the ‘big picture’ – What topic are you writing about and why is it important?

Thesis/Position: Remind the reader about your position by rephrasing your thesis _____

Reasons: Remind the reader what your three reasons are by briefly summarizing them: _____

Additional Reasons: Are there any additional reasons you can introduce? Maybe there are reasons that you do not have proof for but would like the reader to consider. _____

Persuasion: What are you asking the reader to do? What specific action would you like the reader to take to address the topic? _____

Wage Labor v. Slave Labor Writing Outline Rubric

Element	Criteria	Rating	Comment
<p>Content and Insight <i>Interpretation of the text or material</i> <i>Depth of understanding</i></p>	<p>3 ideas are insightful and demonstrate thorough and in-depth consideration of the material 2 some ideas are insightful and demonstrate adequate/predictable interpretation of the material 1 few ideas are insightful and demonstrate a superficial or literal understanding/interpretation of the material 0 no ideas are evident which shows a lack of understanding of material</p>	X2	
<p>Structure and Organization <i>Presentation and development of ideas are logical, understandable and coherent</i></p>	<p>3 ideas in writing are presented in a logical, coherent and understandable manner 2 ideas in writing are generally presented in a logical, coherent and understandable manner 1 some ideas in writing are not presented in a logical, coherent, and/or understandable manner. Some lapses in structure/organization make it difficult to follow argument 0 ideas in the writing are not presented in a logical, coherent, and understandable manner. Lapses in structure/organization make it difficult to comprehend points made in the writing</p>	X2	
<p>Support and Development <i>Specific and direct reference to material/text is used to demonstrate validity of thesis</i></p>	<p>3 conclusions are based on specific textual evidence; support is logical and clearly/directly demonstrates the validity of thesis 2 conclusions are based on evidence from text; support is logical and generally demonstrates the validity of thesis 1 some conclusions are based on evidence from text; support lacks specificity 0 conclusions are not supported with evidence from the text</p>	X2	
<p>Grammar, Usage and Mechanics <i>Rules of standard English are applied appropriately</i></p>	<p>3 writing has minor, if any, errors relative to length and complexity of the work 2 writing has errors but is fundamentally sound relative to the length and complexity. Errors do not hinder effective communication of ideas 1 writing has a pattern of errors which may hinder effective communication of ideas 0 writing has excessive errors which seriously hinder communication of ideas</p>		
<p>Presentation <i>Writing conforms to guidelines as established by instructor</i></p>	<p>3 all guidelines for assignment have been followed 2 most guidelines for assignment have been followed 1 some guidelines for assignment have been followed 0 guidelines for assignment have not been followed</p>		

Total: /25pts